#### Grubbs, Cynthia (HRSA)

From:	Grubbs, Cynthia (HRSA)
Sent:	Friday, August 26, 2011 2:07 PM
To:	'dhay@foulston.com'
Subject:	FW: Tenny
Attachments:	Bavley, Alan_8-26-11_C.Grubbs .PDF

High

Importance:

Follow Up Flag:	Follow up
Flag Status:	Flagged

Mr. Hay,

I sent the attached letter to Mr. Bavley at 11:49 AM EST and have not had confirmation of delivery or read receipt.

Cynde

Cynthia Grubbs R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Banks Bureau of Health Professions Health Resources and Services Administration U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Services Office: 301-443-1821 Cell: 301-760-9879

-----Original Message-----From: Grubbs, Cynthia (HRSA) Sent: Friday, August 26, 2011 11:49 AM To: 'Abavley@kcstar.com' Cc: Grubbs, Cynthia (HRSA) Subject: Tenny

Mr. Bavley,

Please see the attached letter regarding the use of the National Practitioner Data Bank.

Cynde

Cynthia Grubbs R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Banks Bureau of Health Professions Health Resources and Services Administration U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Services Office: 301-443-1821 Cell: 301-760-9879

1



Bureau of Health Professions

Rockville, MD 20857

AUG 2 6 2011

Alan Bavley Health Reporter Kansas City Star 1729 Grand Blvd Kansas City, Missouri 64108

Mr. Bavley:

The U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) has been informed that you may be writing an article for publication in the Kansas City Star which potentially involves the republication of information obtained from the National Practitioner Data Bank (NPDB). Please note that NPDB reports and the information derived from them are protected by Federal law.

The Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) operates the NPDB which is a flagging system intended to assist health care entities in evaluating health care practitioner's licensure, professional society memberships, medical malpractice payment history, and clinical privileging history. The information reported to the NPDB is confidential and is not to be disclosed or redisclosed outside of HHS except in furtherance of professional review activities. As specifically required under Federal regulation, any individual who receives information from the NPDB, directly or indirectly, must use NPDB information solely with respect to the purpose for which it was disclosed by HHS. Any individuals who violate the confidentiality provision could be subject to a civil monetary penalty.

More specifically, the confidentiality regulations governing the NPDB (45 CFR 60.15), state:

- (a) Limitations on disclosure. Information reported to the NPDB is considered confidential and shall not be disclosed outside the Department of Health and Human Services, except as specified in §§ 60.12, 60.13, and 60.16. Persons who, and entities which, receive information from the NPDB either directly or from another party must use it solely with respect to the purpose for which it was provided. Nothing in this paragraph shall prevent the disclosure of information by a party which is authorized under applicable State law to make such disclosure.
- (b) Penalty for violations. Any person who violates paragraph (a) shall be subject to a civil money penalty of up to \$11,000 for each violation. This penalty will be imposed pursuant to procedures at 42 CFR part 1003.

The NPDB confidentiality provision does not apply to the original documents or records from which the reported information is derived. Therefore, for example, the NPDB confidentiality

provisions do not bar or restrict the release of the underlying documents forming the basis for reports, or the information itself, by the entity taking the adverse action or making the payment in settlement of a written medical malpractice complaint or claim. However, even the existence of NPDB reports regarding specific practitioners is considered confidential information.

We assume that you will be abiding by all the requirements of the NPDB confidentiality provision. If you have any questions regarding the confidentiality of NPDB information, please feel free to contact me directly.

Sincerely,

rubb

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Banks

Cc: Robert T. Tenny, M.D.

#### Grubbs, Cynthia (HRSA)

From: To: Sent: Subject: Hay, Dick [dhay@foulston.com] Grubbs, Cynthia (HRSA) Friday, August 26, 2011 4:22 PM Read: FW: Tenny

Your message was read on Friday, August 26, 2011 4:21:59 PM (GMT-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Robert T. Tenny, M.D. Neurological Surgery	
10550 Quivira – Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
DATE: August 24, 2011	FAX: 1-703-803-1964
O:NPDB	FROM: RTT
TTN: Customer Service Branch	RE: UNAUTHORIZED USE OF INFORMATION

#### COMMENTS

# URGENT

Please see the attached email that my attorney received from Mr. Alan Bavley, a reporter for the Kansas City Star newspaper. The settlements made in the cases listed were all CONFIDENTIAL. PLEASE HELP!

#### CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:

The documents accompanying this telecopy transmission contain information belonging to the sender which is confidential and may be legally privileged. The documents or any information contained therein may not be reproduced nor disseminated in any fashion without the written permission of the sender. The information is intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or the taking of any action in reliance on the contents of this telecopied information is strictly prohibited. If you have received this telecopy in error, please notify us by telephone immediately to arrange for the return of the original documents.

#### FOULSTON SIEFKIN



#### Mason, Samantha

Subject:

FW: Robert Tenny

From: "Bavley, Alan - Kansas City" <<u>ABavley@kcstar.com</u>> Date: August 16, 2011 7:44:04 PM CDT To: "Hay, Dick" <<u>dhay@foulston.com</u>> Cc: "Barker, Jesse - Kansas City" <<u>JBarker@kcstar.com</u>> Subject: Robert Tenny

Mr. Hay,

Once again, I would like to offer you and your client, Robert Tenny, the opportunity to provide comment for a story the Kansas City Star plans to publish later this month about Dr. Tenny.

The story will refer to the upcoming disciplinary hearing for Dr. Tenny involving the petition by the Kansas State Board of Healing Arts, the lawsuit brought against Dr. Tenny by the family of Maribeth Chase, and provious malpractice suits filed against Dr. Tenny dating back to Mika vs. C.M. Striebinger MD, et al in 1983 to the present.

Specific cases the story may describe include Alonge vs. Tenny, Baumgartner et al vs. Tenny, Johnson vs. Tenny et al.

The story also will include information obtained from the National Practitioner Data Bank that shows Dr. Tenny was denied olinical privileges by a health care organization in 1995 for reasons of incompetence, malpractice or negligence, that 15 payments have been made on Dr. Tenny's behalf to settle malpractice claims and that the total amount of the payments is approximately \$3.7 million.

Your comments or those of Dr. Tenny, a denial of responsibility or wrong-doing in any of these matters and a summary of your planned defense of Dr. Tenny in the upcoming license hearing, for exemple, would be welcome.

Thank you for your consideration,

Alan Bavley

Kansas Oity Star

816-234-4858 .

1



Robert T. Tenny, M.D. Neurological Surgery

10550 Quivira – Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988

September 4, 2011

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Bank

Dear Ms. Grubbs,

Enclosed is a copy of the lead, front-page article that appeared in the Kansas City Star on Sunday, September 4, 2011. I feel that the information contained in the 3<sup>rd</sup>, 7<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> paragraphs could have only come from the National Data Bank records. Under the section, *How Many Doctors*, I feel that the information in the 4<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> paragraphs also come from the National Data Bank. I am sure that you will find the information in the section, *Using the federal files*, also interesting and, I hope, will change the way the public data is presented.

Respectfully,

thoped rtenny, mas

Robert T. Tenny, M.D.

Back to web version

Cent

Sunday, Sep 4, 2011

#### Posted on Set, Sep. 03, 2011 Doctors with histories of alleged malpractice often go undisciplined

By ALAN BAVLEY The Kansas City Star

Maribeth Chase didn't know that the neurosurgeon who would be operating on her had been sued at least 16 times for allegedly making medical mistakes.

She didn't know that former patients and their families contended in court records that he had botched treatments that left one patient dead, several more with paralysis and still others in need of remedial operations.

Or that a dozen years before, federal records show, a health care organization had denied him clinical privileges over concerns about the quality of his care.

Robert Tenny's Kansas medical license was in good standing. And even though state licensing officials had access to his history of malpractice claim payments, dating to the early 1990s, they had never taken action against him.

That's not uncommon. An investigation by The Kansas City Star found that Kansas and Missouri doctors like Tenny with significant histories of alleged malpractice often go undisciplined by the states' licensing boards.

And although the two states' boards have access to malpractice claims information from several sources, they don't make it available to the public — unlike the boards in many other states.

Chase, 77, never recovered from the relatively common procedure — draining a pool of blood from the surface of her brain — that Tenny performed four years ago at Shawnee Mission Medical Center.

She awoke from the surgery paralyzed on the right side of her body and unable to speak, the victim of a brain injury sustained during the operation. Over the days that followed, her condition deteriorated. She slipped into unconsciousness and died.

Tenny settled her family's wrongful death suit for \$1,010,000. The settlement brought total malpractice payments made on Tenny's behalf since the early 1990s to roughly \$3.7 million, federal records indicate.

Tenny's attorney, Charles R. Hay, said federal patient privacy regulations prevented Tenny from commenting. But in court filings and in a deposition taken for the lawsuit, Tenny denied wrongdoing and said he did not cause Chase's injury.

Although disciplinary proceedings against him are pending, Tenny's Kansas license remains untarnished to this day. And though Shawnee Mission Medical Center suspended his staff privileges, he's still practicing at other area hospitals in Kansas.

Tenny is just one of 21 doctors The Star found who have spotless Kansas and Missouri licenses even after lengthy histories of malpractice cases.

Some have been sued over patient deaths and serious injuries. Some allegedly operated on the wrong body parts, made incorrect diagnoses, delivered unnecessary treatment or left surgical materials inside their patients.

None of their records shows any kind of discipline by the states' medical licensing boards.

In 17 states, including California, Colorado, Georgia and New York, patients can go to medical boards' websites to find out about doctors' malpractice histories.

But not in Kansas and Missouri. That leaves sifting through court records as the only way to discover a doctor's malpractice litigation history. And because many settlements are confidential, there is no certainty that all of a doctor's malpractice payments could be found.

"I find it very disturbing that people can go into an emergency room and be treated by (Tenny) after all that has happened," said Chase's daughter, Claire Chase of Lenexa.

Kansas and Missouri board officials say they do take doctors' malpractice case histories into account when initiating investigations. Doctors and insurance companies are required to notify the boards about malpractice payments. The information also is collected by a federal agency, the National Practitioner Data Bank, that makes it available to state boards.

"Certainly malpractice payments, when we receive those reports, are scrutinized. Any information that is concerning is scrutinized," said Kathleen Selzler Lippert, executive director of the Kansas State Board of Healing Arts.

"But just because there's a (malpractice) payout doesn't mean there's grounds for disciplinary action," Lippert said. "Some malpractice payments are a business calculation, a cost-benefit analysis of whether to go to trial."

Some specialists, including neurosurgeons and heart surgeons, are sued more often than other doctors.

A recent survey by the American Medical Association found that most doctors will be sued for malpractice by the time they retire. But the majority will never face more than one lawsuit. And even when they are sued, doctors generally prevail, studies have found.

Doctors who are sued repeatedly and successfully are uncommon.

"If you're a doctor with more than two malpractice payments, you're in a rare group," said Russell Aims, spokesman for the Massachusetts Board of Registration in Medicine.

Of the 34,000 physicians licensed in the state, fewer than 100 will make more than two payments on malpractice claims over the course of 10 years, he said.

Nationwide, fewer than 2 percent of doctors have accounted for half the reported \$67 billion paid out for malpractice claims in the United States since 1990, according to a study by Robert Oshel, a former analyst for the National Practitioner Data Bank.

"Taking that 2 percent of physicians out of practice would certainly make quite a difference," Oshel said.

"I wouldn't necessarily recommend revoking the licenses of all the docs responsible for half of the payments. Some who have a single large payment are probably good, safe, doctors. But all of them, especially those with multiple payments, would be good candidates for investigation by the licensing boards."

In Kansas and Missouri, the licensing boards are appointed by the states' governors and are made up mostly of physicians. They can discipline doctors for dishonorable conduct or professional incompetence by issuing reprimands, suspending their licenses or even revoking them.

A week after her mother died in March 2007, Claire Chase filed a detailed complaint about Tenny with the Kansas board.

Eight months later, the Chase family's attorney, Victor Bergman, sent the board copies of depositions taken for the lawsuit, along with a letter outlining his case against Tenny.

But according to documents obtained by The Star, the Kansas board did not start formal disciplinary proceedings against Tenny until June 2010. After more than a year of legal wrangling, the board's case against Tenny — based on his treatment of Maribeth Chase — is not yet scheduled for a hearing.

#### How many doctors?

To see whether other doctors with long malpractice payment histories are practicing in Kansas and Missouri, The Star analyzed thousands of records in the National Practitioner Data Bank.

The federal agency in 1990 began gathering information on payments to settle malpractice claims against doctors. It also collects reports of disciplinary actions taken against doctors by licensing agencies and hospitals and by the Drug Enforcement Administration.

State medical boards can use the Data Bank to review license applications or to initiate disciplinary investigations. For a fee, the Data Bank will even email boards within 24 hours when a report of a malpractice payment or disciplinary action is filed.

Data Bank files available to the public have fewer details and are stripped of information identifying doctors by name. The Star linked Tenny to entries in the Data Bank by comparing its public reports to information about Tenny contained in court filings.

The Star found about 200 doctors who have practiced in Kansas or Missouri since 1990 and have had five or more malpractice case payments made on their behalf, without ever being disciplined by the state's board. The number of malpractice claims against the doctors is unclear because individual cases may involve payments from more than one source.

Twenty-one of these doctors, including Tenny, have a record of at least 10 malpractice payments and as many as 19. Malpractice payouts for these doctors exceed \$65 million. Their malpractice cases involved at least 10 patient deaths; at least 32 other patients sustained serious permanent injury.

In a handful of cases, these doctors also saw their hospital privileges revoked or suspended for substandard skills, malpractice or, as in Tenny's case in 2007, because the hospital considered him an immediate threat to patients' health or safety.

Kansas and Missouri aren't the only states where doctors with significant alleged malpractice histories have gone undisciplined by medical boards.

The advocacy group Public Citizen this year released a nationwide analysis of the Data Bank. It found 14 states, including Kansas and Missouri, with physicians who had at least 10 malpractice payments, plus at least one report by a hospital revoking or limiting clinical privileges, but who had not been disciplined by their state. One undisciplined doctor in New Mexico had 26 malpractice cases. A doctor in Indiana had 20.

#### Weighing the records

Patient safety advocates say boards should use malpractice records to their full advantage to ferret out doctors who may be doing harm. The boards themselves, though, aren't as confident about the records' value.

Boards commonly review malpractice cases, said Lisa Robin, chief advocacy officer for the Federation of State Medical Boards. But a history of malpractice payments is not the most reliable sign that a doctor should be disciplined, she said.

"We believe (previous) disciplinary actions against a license are much more significant than a malpractice payment," Robin said.

Some states make it harder than others to file a malpractice lawsuit, Robin said. And even within states, juries in some court districts may favor patients, while in other districts they favor doctors.

Oftentimes, cases that lead to malpractice payments may not offer legal grounds for disciplining a doctor, Robin said. An insurance company may settle a case not because a doctor is at fault, but because a trial would be too expensive. In other cases, several health care providers may share responsibility.

"There may be whole systems that failed. Not just one person is to blame," Robin said.

For reasons such as these, Lippert, executive director of the Kansas board, called The Star's findings about doctors' malpractice payment histories "very nebulous information" that doesn't indicate whether a doctor should be disciplined.

"It's a piece of information without context," she said. "It's really hard to evaluate."

Whether a doctor poses a danger to the public is a key factor in determining discipline, according to Lippert --- not the number of malpractice cases.

"You can practice the best medicine in the world and still have tragic consequences" that lead to malpractice payments, she said. "You can practice bad medicine but not have bad results" that wind up in court.

But patient safety advocates say malpractice reports still are useful indicators of how a doctor practices.

"A better board should use all of its resources, whether it's a complaint against a doctor or an action taken by a hospital or a report of a malpractice payment," said Sidney Wolfe, a physician and director of Public Citizen's Health Research Group. "And malpractice payments are the most common piece of data by far in the National Practitioner Data Bank."

Investigating malpractice cases may be time-consuming, but often much of the groundwork already has been done by the lawyers who filed the lawsuits, Wolfe said.

"You start with the existing records and proceed from there," he said.

Each year the staff of the Missouri Board of Registration for the Healing Arts reviews reports on about 700 to 800 malpractice claims made against doctors, board spokesman Travis Ford said. The claims reports, with information about the doctors and patients and the nature of the allegations, come in quarterly from the state insurance department.

The claims are more useful than reports of malpractice payments, Ford said.

"It's the allegation behind the claim that is serious," he said. "Whether there's a payment or not wouldn't influence the board's action."

About 90 percent of the claims lead to full investigations, with staff interviewing doctors and patients and witnesses, Ford said. But very few lead to discipline.

Before the Missouri board can take disciplinary action for malpractice, it must demonstrate that a doctor negligently failed to provide patients with the recognized standard of care, Ford said. And unless a doctor demonstrated a willful disregard for a patient's welfare, there has to be a pattern of repeated negligence before the board can act.

In Kansas, similar criteria apply.

And in both states, cases may go through an independent administrative hearing, similar to a trial, before the boards are authorized to take disciplinary action.

"It's easy for the board to decide that someone should be suspended or revoked, but the board isn't the ultimate decider," Ford said.

#### 'Something was dreadfully wrong'

No one knows exactly why blood welled up on the surface of Maribeth Chase's brain and made her a candidate for surgery.

In elderly people like her, even a minor bump on the head can tear small blood vessels and cause a slow bleed between the brain and the membrane covering it. The condition, called a chronic subdural hematoma, may not show any symptoms at first. Brains shrink with age, and that leaves room for blood to accumulate. Blood may build up over time, even for months, before it puts pressure on the brain.

Chase, a retired speech therapist, had moved from Iowa to Lenexa to be closer to family members. In February 2007 she started having headaches and found it hard to remember words. Her handwriting started to change.

On the way to a gym for aerobics one day, her vision blurred. Her doctor told her to go to the emergency room at Shawnee Mission Medical Center.

Surgery for a subdural hematoma like Chase's is often a routine procedure. The surgeon drills two quartersize or smaller holes through the skull and drains the blood. Typically, the slow bleed doesn't damage the brain, and patients get better in a few weeks.

Claire Chase remembered Tenny saying her mother would make a full recovery; she would spend a day or two in intensive care, a few more days in the hospital and then go home.

After the surgery, family members said, Tenny told them the operation had gone well. But it soon became clear that wasn't the case.

"I didn't notice until the next day. She was paralyzed on the right side. She couldn't talk, but she was clearly there — she grabbed my hand," Claire Chase said. "Obviously, something was dreadfully wrong, and it didn't go as planned."

Maribeth Chase's son, John Chase, an orthopedic surgeon, had flown in from Florida to be by her side. He called a neurosurgeon friend for advice.

"You've had a major complication," he recalled his friend saying. "A big problem. She may die."

Tenny told Chase's son and daughter shortly after the operation that their mother had suffered a stroke, their lawsuit alleges.

But the family said they heard little more from the doctor.

"He would not give any information at the time, and I didn't realize I should have been grilling him, interrogating him because I didn't know what to expect," John Chase said. "I took what he said at face value."

Evidence gathered for the Chase family's lawsuit showed that on the day after the operation, Tenny had booked an operating room to perform additional surgery on Chase, but it was never done. He called his malpractice insurance company. And he phoned the hospital to have a do-not-resuscitate order added to Chase's medical records, the suit alleged.

Her family did not know about the do-not-resuscitate order, John Chase said.

Months later, Tenny would place an addendum in his hospital operative report that during the surgery he "noted a small piece of brain tissue draining out" of one of the holes in Chase's skull. His initial report made no reference to a brain injury.

As their mother's condition deteriorated, the family asked for a neurologist to consult on the case. Brain scans showed there was bleeding into Chase's brain and pockets of air that indicated the brain had been penetrated, John Chase said.

The neurologist reported the incident to the hospital. In her deposition, the hospital's risk manager said Tenny told her that a nurse in the operating room apparently injured Chase by using a bulb syringe to squirt saline solution into one of the holes. She said Tenny told her the nurse did this without his permission.

When the hospital investigated, it found that the nurse Tenny named had not even participated in the operation, according to court depositions and hospital documents.

"That's just so transparent," John Chase said. "He couldn't even remember which wrong guy to blame here."

The family's lawsuit alleged that Tenny intentionally kept from them the facts about Chase's post-operative condition. Had the family known what had happened, immediate surgical intervention may have "substantially increased" Chase's chances of survival and an acceptable quality of life, the lawsuit alleged.

"We never had the opportunity to make that decision" for emergency surgery, John Chase said. "(Tenny) knew there was a problem but he ... just let her sit there."

In his answer to the Chase family's lawsuit, Tenny admitted that Maribeth Chase's death was, in retrospect, a result of trauma she suffered during surgery, but he denied that a follow-up operation would have changed her outcome. And in his deposition testimony, Tenny held steadfastly to his assertion that the nurse he had named was the person who had forcefully irrigated Chase's brain.

Asked why everyone else who was in the operating room contradicted Tenny about who assisted him with the surgery, Tenny answered:

"Well, I can't comment as far as their motives, or intentions, or their memory of the events; I can only testify to what I observed."

#### Informing the public

The ordeal of her mother's surgery has shaken Claire Chase."I certainly at this point wouldn't trust ... (a) doctor without checking their history," she said.

But the limited information available on the Kansas and Missouri board websites doesn't offer much help to the average person trying to assess a doctor's background. Other states make some information about doctors' malpractice case histories public.

After years of study and legislative action, the North Carolina Medical Board started posting malpractice payment information about the doctors it licenses on its website in December 2009. A television news report on the postings caused a surge in web traffic.

"There has been a steady drumbeat from the public and the press for more information. This is the board's reaction to what the public expected," board spokeswoman Jean Fisher Brinkley said.

The board doesn't report the dollar amounts of payments, nor does it list payments of less than \$75,000. Some doctors were concerned that nuisance lawsuits settled for relatively small amounts would appear on their records.

"We had people boldly predict no one would want to settle a case again because they wouldn't want it to show up on their record," Brinkley said. "As far as we can see, it's business as usual."

Brinkley said the malpractice information might raise as many questions as it answers. She recently got a call from someone asking whether he should go to a particular orthopedic surgeon who had a report of a malpractice payment.

"I told him I can't say whether he provided substandard care. All I could say was he had a payment."

But Brinkley has heard people say about the malpractice postings, " 'If I had known that, I would never have gone to that doctor.' This allows patients to go in with their eyes open. The point is, we're being transparent."

Lippert said the Kansas board has not discussed making malpractice payment information available in this way. In Missouri, the law was changed recently to allow the board to post information about doctors' education, discipline by boards in other states and practice limitations ordered by courts.

"To get this far is a dramatic step for transparency," Ford said.

So far the Missouri board hasn't asked lawmakers for permission to disclose doctors' malpractice histories, Ford said, "but I think we're always reviewing possible legislation."

John Chase serves as a reviewer of cases brought to the Florida Board of Medicine.

The Florida board investigates patient deaths and neurological injuries quickly, he said. "I know how this is supposed to work."

Chase said he has never been sued for malpractice, but he worries about it with every patient he sees. And he believes insurance companies may settle malpractice lawsuits against doctors' wishes just to make cases go away.

"There can be a payout where there isn't negligence," he said. "But again, where there's smoke, there's fire. It's (a medical board's) job to put the whole picture together.

"The best and most efficient way to discipline substandard physicians is through the board."

#### Giving the public access to malpractice reports

In the late 1990s, Massachusetts became the first state to make comprehensive profiles of the physicians it licenses available to the public.

The profiles, on the Massachusetts Board of Registration in Medicine website, include basic information about doctors' education, medical specialties, business addresses and affiliations with insurance plans and hospitals.

Doctors can include professional and community awards they've received and information about their research or publications.

Each profile shows the number of malpractice claims against the doctor that led to a payment in the past 10 years. The date of each payment is given, but not the specific amount. Instead, the profile tells whether the payment was average or above or below average for that doctor's specialty.

The profile also gives the percentage of doctors in that specialty who made a malpractice payment in the past 10 years. Among Massachusetts neurosurgeons, for example, 14.5 percent have made one or more payments.

Each profile also lists criminal convictions and disciplinary actions taken by hospitals or the board in the past 10 years.

The profile site gets about 20 million hits per year from 600,000 to 700,000 unique users, board spokesman Russell Aims said.

#### One doctor's history of malpractice cases

By the time Robert Tenny operated on Maribeth Chase in 2007, court records show, he had been sued by patients or their families at least 16 times since 1983.

While consistently denying the allegations, Tenny eventually settled at least six of these lawsuits, court records indicate. For the rest of the cases, the outcome either isn't clear from the records, the cases were dismissed or, in at least one case, the verdict was in Tenny's favor.

#### Among the cases Tenny settled:

•Two back operations that allegedly left one man partially paralyzed below the waist and another man paralyzed in all four limbs. Before operating, Tenny allegedly had told the patient who would suffer quadriplegia that surgery would not worsen his condition.

•Surgery on a carotid artery of a 74-year-old woman whose post-operative care Tenny allegedly mismanaged, leading to her death. The lawsuit contended that the woman suffered "marked bleeding" from her surgical wound and was bleeding when Tenny transferred her from intensive care to a regular hospital floor. Tenny settled the lawsuit brought by the woman's family for \$750,000, according to Victor Bergman, the family's attorney.

•Allegedly disfiguring and ineffective surgery that cut open a patient's skull to remove a tumor behind his left eye. A biopsy, brain scans and a second operation by an eye surgeon allegedly found that Tenny had missed the tumor and removed other tissue instead. The patient claimed he was left with blurred and double vision, nausea, migraines and hand tremors.

#### A case Tenny won:

•The alleged failure of Tenny and other doctors to diagnose and treat a woman's spinal infection before it caused paralysis and lack of sensation in her lower extremities. The patient alleged Tenny should have reviewed an MRI scan himself, rather than rely on a report by a radiologist. A jury found Tenny and two other doctors not at fault. The hospital and two additional doctors settled before the trial.

#### Using the federal files

The Kansas City Star analyzed National Practitioner Data Bank records from 1990 through 2010 of physicians who have had payments made on their behalf in Kansas or Missouri for malpractice claims and who have not been disciplined by the state's medical board.

The Data Bank's public files are designed to make identification of individual doctors difficult, if not impossible. Doctors are identified by a number rather than by their name, and those numbers change periodically.

The records used by The Star may include doctors who no longer practice in Kansas or Missouri, but also may exclude doctors who had malpractice histories in other states before practicing in Kansas or Missouri.

The methodology used to analyze the data was recommended by Robert Oshel, retired Data Bank associate director who created its public use file. Oshel also provided databases to The Star for Kansas and Missouri.

The records show about 200 doctors with five or more malpractice payments who have practiced in Kansas or Missouri but have never been disciplined by the states' licensing boards.

For some of these doctors, the actual number of individual malpractice claims may be lower than the number of payments counted. That's because Kansas has a Health Care Stabilization Fund that makes separate payments for some claims in addition to payments made by doctors' insurance carriers.

The Data Bank identifies whether payments were made by the state fund or by an insurance company but does not make clear whether payments from these sources were applied to the same case.

The total amounts of payments cited by The Star are conservative estimates.

The public data do not list the specific amount of each payment. Instead, the Data Bank places each payment within a range and reports the midpoint of that range. For example, if the actual payment is \$131,500, the range would be \$130,001 to \$140,000 and would be reported by the Data Bank at the midpoint of \$135,000. For each payment, The Star used the lower amount of the range rather than the reported midpoint.

The Data Bank also lists separately amounts that are supposed to be paid over time. The Star did not include these additional amounts in its estimates because it could not verify that these payments were made.

The Star's review of the National Practitioner Data Bank found:

21 doctors with 10 or more malpractice payments made on their behalf, including at least one payment in Kansas or Missouri, but no disciplinary action in that state.

\$65 million paid in the 263 total payments on behalf of those doctors.

@ Go to KansasCity.com for excerpts of Robert Tenny's taped deposition from the Maribeth Chase case.

To reach Alan Bavley, call 816-234-4858 or send email to abavley@kcstar.com.

© 2011 Kansas City Star and wire service sources. All Rights Reserved. http://www.kansascity.com



Robert T. Tenny, M.D. Neurological Surgery

10550 Quivira – Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988

September 5, 2011

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Bank Department of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

Re: K.C. Star Article

Dear Ms Grubbs,

If Mr. Bavley were able to extract the data for his article from the publicly provided information from the National Practitioner Data Bank, would there be any record of his inquiry? Also to perform the type of data analysis that he claims to have done, he would have to identify all of the neurosurgeons in the geographic area that the public data covers, search each of the appropriate county court records (in my case at least five counties) and then form a large spreadsheet to include all the cases reported by both the courts and the Data Bank and be able to match them. If he did this, does he have the records to prove it? Would there be records of his inquiries at each of the county court houses, especially coming from a reporter? If he made his inquiries via the Internet, there should be an electronic record of his actions? If he hired someone to do this work, the same should apply. If he did hire someone to do his research, where did he obtain the revenue to finance the project, who did he pay and how much and when? There should be records of this information. Was he paid by someone to write the article? His financial records might indicate this information.

Obviously, his article has significantly questioned the security of your data.

According to a media consultant, Mr. Bavley does not develop his own material, but rather he writes from the material that has been provided to him. This, to me, would suggest that he was given Data Bank information (probably from a complex spreadsheet.

If I can be of further assistance, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Partet Terry, wo

Robert T. Tenny, M.D.



#### Robert T. Tenny, M.D.

Neurological Surgery

10550 Quivira – Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988

September 7, 2011

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Bank Department of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

Re: Editorial K.C. Star

Dear Ms Grubbs,

I have enclosed a copy of the lead editorial in the Kansas City Star from September 7, 2011. I am sorry that the yellow background highlighting the editorial did not copy well. It is apparent that the article (and now with the editorial) was not the product of a lone reported, but rather a concerted effort by the K.C. Star to end my professional career. I am sure that you are asking the question, why?

Shawnee Mission Medical Center is a heavy advertiser in the K.C. Star and their logos frequently co-appear on several items. At the time of the surgical procedure on **Constant**, the surgical scrub, **Constant** performed a forceful irrigation upon the patient's brain. Suspecting that this may have injured my patient, I reported this event to the hospital risk manager and to the patient's family. Within a few days, the hospital informed me that **Constant** was the surgical scrub of record and that I was mistaken. The hospital took sworn statement from **Constant**, **Constant**, **Constant** and **Constant** (the recorder of the data) and they all testified to the hospital's timeline. However, I kept pressing.

Enclosed is material that Shawnee Mission Medical Center produced, but they did not think that I would do the math. I believe that Shawnee Mission is guilty of Medicare Fraud in that they altered the medical records of two is guilty of Medicare Fraud in that they altered the medical records of two patients who had undergone total joint procedure (that would most likely be in the Medicare age group) and of a third patient that may or may not be over 65. My attorney's have tried numerous times to subpoen the remaining information to prove my contention and we have been told that it does not exist and/or it is privileged and cannot be released. I have a new group of attorneys who are trying to obtain this information and I believe that this action has prompted Shawnee Mission Medical Center to ask their publicist, the Kansas City Star, to destroy my career before I can prove their deception. Where can I go for help?

Sincerely,

Robert r Tenny, MD

Robert T. Tenny, M.D.



Yael T. Abouhalkah, Kansas City Star editorial page columnist, on it came from the /oices blog at voices.kansascity.co hat Democra

# HE STAR'S EDITORIAL

Doctors' licensing boards must end secret ways

regulating medical professionals are nuch too slow to acknow advocacy group, placed Missouri states are overlooking excessive could serve as warnings about a oards charged with lice ay by The Star showed that both me when the public is demanding ty and the services they use h nsing boards in both states are id Kansas in a group of only 14 An analysis by Public Citizen, an wing practicing privileges revoked A detailed report published Sur oblems and deal That's not a club to which either tes that had not disciplined phy limited by at least one hospital. vsician's performance ans who had at least 10 maltice payments, plus a record of actice claim payments that with the information they he Kansas and ion on the prod pour doctors and other laying action with them. At a a prop ucts they sing and



is a common occurrence. A pattern of multiple payouts is a big red tiag practice claim against a doctor – one lawsuit Nationwide, fewer than ity of doctors never face more than As The Star reported, the major-

ETTERS

state should belong. An isolated

sumers to decide i Kansas neurosurgeon, Robert Tenny, who had been sued at lea practice claims availab information about succ While many other states to times and paid more than \$2 oatients defenseless, July leath of a patient at the hands of hether repeated malpractice enny's license with the Kansas aims should be seen as a problem ainst doctors, combin ate Board of Healing Arts was in I he Star's report detailed the tormation vacuum, leave DUC, Kansas and Miss he reluctance to take al to 77-year-old lion as a result. Yet at the time he ormed the surgery that ncies don't even allow con-

start formal disciplinary proceedabout her death, the licensing agency took almost three years to ormation from Chase's family ood standing. Despite receiving extensive in-

BIGSTOCK PHOTO

ustories seriously ction for taking doctors scipline doctors with stors and shubou ion as to why the n boards owe tures that protec ractice payout

search a doctor's cre nysicians and the c with easily acco **Overall**, the Kans n and record. Veither state board osites are confus hocre job of provid or consumers to are locked i

nto context for cor

ansparent, Othe ans with froubl out taking acti hey also sho

Board of Regist Arts need to

ne Kansas boa

und ways to ma

hile also putting th out malpractice d

who On the day of the surgical procedure, 2/27/07, had recently been promoted to the position of afternoon Operating Room Coordinator, indicated to Dr. Tenny that, because of a staffing shortage, he, would be the individual to scrub the surgical procedure for Dr Tenny. He later informed Dr Tenny that the should be was working and that finished with the case in which he, would be available to scrub Dr. Tenny's case instead. It is was aware of this speculated that the circulating nurse, information and that she entered the name of at the beginning of the computerized data entry form as "1st Scrub" while the surgical suite, OR 1, was being "turned over" from the prior surgical procedure and preparing for Dr. Tenny's case. This name, would then be stored into the system and the next window would appear on the computer screen for the complete.

Before the start of Dr. Tenny's surgical procedure, **Security** was scrubbed and **Security** was preparing the surgical equipment and the supplies for Dr. Tenny's surgical procedure. **Security** indicated to Dr. Tenny that **Security** was still assisting in another surgical case and that **Security** would not be available in time to start Dr. Tenny's case, so he, **Security**, would be assisting in the case after all. It is speculated that the circulating nurse, **Security**, did not scroll back through all of the, now completed, computer window forms, to the beginning, to change the name of the "1<sup>st</sup> Scrub" from **Security** to

Enclosed is data, provided by Shawnee Mission Medical Center, indicating the number of minutes of attendance for each person in OR 1 (Operating Room 1), OR 2 and OR 3 for February 27, 2007. On the first page, in the third column, from the left, is the title, Primary Surgeon. On the 16<sup>th</sup> line down, is listed, Tenny MD, Robert T, across from that is, the name of the patient, the procedure, the person in attendance, their role in the procedure and the number of minutes in attendance for that procedure. On the second page, in the second column, nine lines down from OR-02-SM, is listed OR-03-SM and, going across is the name of the surgeon, procedure, attendee, role and number of minutes of attendance. On the bottom, **Mathematical Science** is listed as 1<sup>st</sup> Scrub with 144 minutes of attendance. If one looks at the second case, in OR-3, **Mathematical Science** and he was in attendance for 67 minutes in the third case. On the next page is the "Time Line for **Contraction**". The next two pages explain some of the activities that occur during "turn over" between surgical cases.

The next page has the "More Realistic Time Line for **the second s** 

On the last page, is a copy of the time card for **Contraction**. On 02/27/07, it shows that **Contraction** timed-in (which is done electronically) at 0630 (6:30 AM). This time card is from his sworn deposition.

In reviewing the previous documents, there are several different scenarios

SMMC has offered the scenario that the first case in OR 3 started at 6:30 time card states that he checked in. AM, the exact time that After the surgical personnel time-in, they go to the men's locker room (in case), change into their surgical scrubs and, in the case of a surgical scrub (the job of the surgical supplies for that surgical procedure need to be acquired (usually from a checklist), a sterile field established, a surgical hand scrub of several minutes, sterile gowning and gloving of the surgical technician ( ), which he does by himself, with the aid of someone to tie up the back of his gown, then sterilely turn the back of the gown around to cover the back, the surgical instruments and supplies are opened, counted (with another individual in the operating room and the count is recorded) and instruments and supplies are arranged on a sterile field (and there are a lot of equipment/supplies for a total joint replacement operation - the first case in OR 3). All of these events usually occur prior to the patient being brought into the operating room and, certainly, prior to the start of the surgical procedure. This is the rationale for the staff arriving at 6:30 AM in anticipation of a 7:30 AM surgical start time.

In order to secure their testimony, Shawnee Mission Medical Center obtained sworn statements from the secure of the event. Dr. Tenny, subsequently, questioned Shawnee Mission Medical Center about their timeline and requested more information. It is speculated that when SMMC reviewed the records for the attendance and founder the secure of the secure and OR 3, at the same time. SMIMC might be reluctant to release the records because it would discredit the sworn testimony of its three employees and it would also raise the question of a "cover-up" regarding the presence of during that time. After all, how could **Constant** done anything wrong if he was not there?

SMMC might have gone back and changed the medical records so that was only in one location at a time and, if discovered, this action could expose SMMC to a large variety issues.

The necessary records to clarify this issue have been requested and subpoenaed from SMMC on numerous occasions without receiving an adequate response.

It may all be coincides, but the subscription of afternoon Operating Room Coordinator a few days before the day of the surgical procedure, resigned from SMMC to work as an agency staff nurse. The subscription of the Risk Manager for SMMC at the time, reportedly had told several individuals about her dislike for the private practice of law; but within a few months, she left SMMC for private practice and her supervisor had left SMMC even earlier.



Page



.

Ţ



P

#### TIME LINE FOR

Shawnee Mission Medical Center Department of Surgery

Page 3 OR 03-SM – Consecutive surgical cases for 144 minutes (2:24), 155 minutes (2:35), and 67 minutes (1:07)

Assuming that the first surgical procedure began at 7:30 AM (the usual start time) and that the testimony of **Control** during his deposition of 10/25/07 regarding the turn over time of 15 minutes between the surgical cases, the following time line would exist:

First Case Start First Case Finish	7:30 9:54	(7:30 + 2:24)
Second Case Start	10:09	(9:54 + 0:15)
Second Case Finish	12:44	(10:09 + 2:35)
Third Case Start	12:59	(12:44 + 0:15)
Third Case Finish	14:06	(12:59 + 1:07)

Dr. Tenny's case started at 13:57 - See SMMC IntraOp

These times do not account for the usual morning break of 15 minutes nor for the 30 minute lunch break.

### SOME OF THE USUAL ACTIVITIES FOR THE SMMC OR PERSONNEL FOR SURGICAL CASE TURN OVER

At the end of the first case:

Collect/bag/remove all contaminated disposable items and fluids.

Collect/bag/remove all contaminated linens.

Collect/assemble/remove all surgical instruments.

Mop the floor, wipe down the OR table, other horizontal surfaces, OR lights and remove body fluids from any other surfaces.

Reconfigure the OR table.

New linen for the OR table.

Bring in the surgical supplies need for the case.

The circulating nurse and CRNA would go to Interview the patient and bring them to the surgical suite. The scrub nurse/tech would create a sterile field, open the needed sterile instruments and sterile supplies, scrub for the case, gown and glove themselves, then begin to arrange the sterile instruments and supplies.

ALL of these activities are usually done PRIOR to the patient entering the OR suite. The official start time is when the patient is brought into the OR suite.

# MORE REALISTIC TIME LINE FOR

The time between cases offered by **Example 1** probably not realistic. The mixture of surgical cases in OR 01-SM, from page one could be used to calculate a better estimate. Assuming that the first case began at 7:30 and it lasted for 93 minutes (1:33). The second case lasted for 230 minutes (3:50). The exact start time of the third case (Dr. Tenny) is known to be 13:57; therefore,

13:57 - 7:30 = 6:27 for entire time that had elapsed from the start of the first case until the start of Dr. Tenny's case.

We know that the two proceeding cases used a total Of 5:23 (1:33 + 3:50), so if we subtract:

Total time 6:27 - proceeding case time 5:23 = 1:04For the turn over time for two cases, or 0:32 per case. If this turn over time is used, would have been finished in OP 03-SM at 14:39, still without a 15 minute morning break nor without a 30 minute lunch. HK3(NOV. 28. 2007; 4:15PM TirlOGAN&LOGAN Begin Date: 02 18 2007 Reason Modf : \*\* + More < > End Date : 03 03 2007 Minute Format: MIN (Min/Hun) Problem: \* (Y/N)

F ] ID * ACTIVE Seatus: 2 + ACTIVE Badge : S Time	Type: 00 + ROSFILL Las Oprt ID: Time Rsn Lunch Net	Pos: 306 01.2480.2 + Total Hours: 69.38 Cost Job Actv Empl Cent+ Class+ Code+ Typ+
AC Date X In		
02 20 2007 0	$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	306 2480 306 2480 00
02 21 2007 б: 02 27 2007 б:	30 18 54 30 11 54	306 2480 00
02282007 G:	- OC 012:00	306 2480 OC 00
03 03 2007 - 03 03 2007 -	- OC 0 12 : 00	306 2480 OC 00

A		 nu are	: positio	: sned =	at the	 botton	n of 1	: the entr	ies	 T.r.	an-PF	Acti	
CLIEN	41.0e	Empl	ID <or></or>	\Badq			Beam	סדיק	Memo	FF6	HR30 HR14		
PF1 PF8	Help Fwd	PF2 PF9	Copy Jump	PF3 PF10	Exit HR14	PF4 PF11	-		Cancel	PF21	HR31	CLR.	Rset



· ·



Robert T. Tenny, M.D. Neurological Surgery

10550 Quivira – Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988

September 11, 2011

Cynthia Grubbs, R N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Bank Department of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

Dear Ms. Grubbs,

There are two observations that you might find useful in your investigation.

First, on September 7, 2011, my attorney, Charles R. Hay, indicated that he had received a telephone call from the attorney that represents **and the second second** 

Second, I have enclosed an advertisement for Shawnee Mission Medical Center that was published in the Sunday Edition of the Kansas City Star (9/11/11). Exactly one week after Mr. Alan Bavley's article. The two points of interest are the size of the ad and, as usual, the co-appearance of the Shawnee Mission Medical Center logo with that of the Kansas City Star. Is this a way to compensate the K.C. Star for its journalistic endeavor? I have also enclosed a copy of the "standard size" ads that most medical centers purchase. This is the first time that I have ever seen an ad of this size by Shawnee Mission Medical Center and I always look. Also, on the page of the second ad, there is an interesting article describing the recent awards that the Kansas City Star has received!

Sincerely,

Rochert or Terring -, mo

Robert T. Tenny, M.D.



Robotic technology is being applied to an increasing number of procedures, including prostatectomy, hysterectomy and nephrectomy. As a result, patients benefit from smaller incisions and faster recoveries. At Shawnee Mission Medical Center, we have the longest running robotics program in Kansas City. Our experience combined with compassionate care helps patients receive better long-term outcomes.

For more information, or to attend a free informational session on robotic surgery, visit LeadingKCCare.com, or call the ASK-A-NURSE Resource Center at 913-676-7777. Partners in Leading KC Care



KMBC-TV

THE\*STAR. KansasCity\*com

staff fo. local business cover age, Star staff for coverage of ural life or agriculture; Donald Bradley for rural life or agricult tre story, Rick Montgomery for education story, Mate-campbell for history story, Sura Bauer for religion stor Nar staff for coverage of family ving and young people; Gen Mullen for page design udd Feeback for best video re Eames and Kent Babb for iformation graphic; John letzer for sports photograph form Langdon, Jacquie Let atto and Mike Enzgerald for didea/promotion -- adverer, Tom Lore and Vana Sectland for ad idea/promos n hewspaper Second place awards: Anne speanet for community series Robertson for breaking buy Rizzo for news story Al. ( Sectors for news story Al. ( Sectors for phono package) lichael. Mansur and Blan Bethloff for sports news stories of packages L brady McColes Roigh for sports feature: Same Mellinger for sports column Were for coverage of govern-minimal and education. David ppet for rural life or agri-ture story Mullen and Stacy Downs for information ic; Keith Myers for video; graphic, Keith Myers for video; Mohty Davis for video; Mike, Hendricks for humor column; Eangdon, Lehatto and Judy Rewhaugh for ad idea/promotion of an advertiser, Lehatto and Tod Machin for ad idea or pronotion for the newspaper. Third-place awards: Bauer

for news or feature series; Star

#### No free flu shots for Kansas City's uninsured adults

Starting Monday, the Kansas City Health Department will begin offering flu vaccinations to adults. But unlike previous years, there won't be any free sitors for the uninsured.

A cut this year in the federal budget for vaccines meant rates received less money. Missouri used to allocate roughly 1,500 doses of flu vaccine to Kansas City for neighborhood outreach clinics and people who didn't have insuraince coverage for the shots. This year, flu vaccine won't be available through that program. The Health Department still has vaccine that it bought, which it is offering for 520 per shot. The cost is covered for people with Medicare or Medi-Cald.

Free vaccine for uninsured children will still be available, but it has not yet been delivered. Vaccination clinics will be

Vaccination clinics will be beld at the Health Department, 2400 Thoost Ave, from 8 am. in 4 p.m. every Monday, Tuesday Wednesday and Friday, and from 8 am. to noon on Thursdays.

The Johnson County Health Department is offering flu shots for \$25. For information about times and locations, go thealth.jocogov.org.

Alan Bavley, bavley@kcstar.com

National rankings can help people make better choices about their hospital.

He will celebrate this year's achievement.

As soon as he finishes what has helped make it possible.

## Best Hospital in Kansas City

chori tette et montrappre

T H E

0

Ranked among the nation's top 50 hospitals in these medical specialties. Cancer • Cardiology & Heart Surgery • Ear, Nose & Throat Gastroenterology • Nephrology • Pulmonology

A D'VANCENG

NATIONAL

At The University of Kansas Hospital, it's our unique role to take on the most serious health challenges in this region. That's why we're particularly proud to be included in this list of hospitals, each distinguished by the way it treats patients who need unusually high levels of care. Saving more lives: This is academic medicine.

THE UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS HOSPITAL

MEDICIN

the Option of Kama Date

E ®

パスギ

.25

Learn more at kumed.com/rankings.

F



#### Robert T. Tenny, M.D.

Neurological Surgery

10550 Quivira – Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988

September 14, 2011

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N, J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Bank Department of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

Dear Ms Grubbs,

Enclosed is a copy of a FAX that I received yesterday that contains an email from Mr. Alan Bavley, of the Kansas City Star, regarding an upcoming article about the National Practitioner Data Bank.

My attorney, Mr. Charles R. Hay, indicated that the second second

Apparently, the disgruntled former Data Bank employee, Robert Oshel, who is referenced in Mr. Bavley's article, of 9/4/11, has published a previous article regarding issues with the Data Bank and, reportedly, Mr. Bavley has plagiarized that work as his own in the K.C. Star article of 9/4/11.

Initially, Mr. Bavley had contacted my attorney, Mr. Hay, wanting to obtain more information about the first case. Mr. Bavley was told that he would need to obtain a signed release prior to any potential information being given. Mr. Bavley indicated that he "did not have enough time" to do that. It seems strange to me that he did not have enough time to do something so simple, especially when he was able to interview several of the family members for his article and that he would have had to invest a tremendous amount of time to collect and to assemble the data that he claims that he did for his article. In keeping with what I have been told before about Mr. Bavley publishing supplied material as opposed to developing his own story and bolstered by the above,

group have developed the material and then sought out Mr. Bavley to be their spokesman?

Why would they pick the Midwest and me? Is it because the small number of neurosurgeons in the geographic reporting area, thus making the data "matching game" technically much easier? If Mr. Bavley had amassed all of this data, would you not think hat several other names would have "fallen out"? I know of several orthopedic surgeons who have had many more lawsuits filed, but because of the larger number of orthopedic surgeons, would this be too big of a subset with which to work? In any case, I am sure that Mr. Bavley did not do the work himself and that he has written the recent article to "buffer" himself. His worst-case scenario is that he knowingly published restricted material and I believe that he feels that nothing will be proven and that he will ride out the storm. I believe what he fears most is that it will be proven that someone else developed all of the material, gave it to him to publish and he claims it as his own. I feel that Mr. Bavley should be required to produce all of his data to prove that he actually did what he claims because if he cannot product his data, it was either fabricated or it came from some else that did all of the work.

Also, in Mr. Bavley's article, he mentioned physician numbers, which are usually not reported in the information that is received by the hospitals from the Data Bank. Could this disgruntled employee have a source within in your department?

A few weeks ago, Mr. Bavley shared a byline with an Associated Press journalist on an article discussing cardiac stents. If there are other cases regarding the reconstruction of Data Bank material, either published or soon to be published, and these articles are supported by one of the advocacy groups, this information will be given to the Associated Press or to Reuter's for a national story.

I have enclosed Mr. Bavley's most recent article.

Sincerely,

Robert & Tenny, mD

Robert T. Tenny, M.D.
#### Mason, Samantha

From: Sent: To: Subject: Hay, Dick Tuesday, September 13, 2011 3:18 PM Mason, Samantha FW: Robert Tenny

Send to Dr. Tenny. Charles R. Hay Foulston & Siefkin LLP Bank of America Tower, Suite 1400 534 South Kansas Avenue Topeka, KS 66603-3436 785-233-3600 dhay@foulston.com

**IRS CIRCULAR 230 NOTICE:** Any U.S. federal tax advice contained in this communication (including any attachments) is not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used, for the purpose of (i) promoting, marketing or recommending to another party any transaction or matter addressed herein or (ii) avoiding penalties under the Internal Revenue Code.

**IMPORTANT:** This communication contains information from the law firm of Foulston Siefkin LLP which may be confidential and privileged. If it appears that this communication was addressed or sent to you in error, you may <u>not</u> use or copy this communication or any information contained therein, and you may <u>not</u> disclose this communication or the information contained therein to anyone else. In such circumstances, please notify me immediately by reply email or by telephone. Thank you.

From: Bavley, Alan - Kansas City [mailto:ABavley@kcstar.com] Sent: Tuesday, September 13, 2011 3:17 PM To: Hay, Dick Subject: Robert Tenny

Mr. Hay,

The Kansas City Star will be publishing a story in tomorrow's paper that will refer to a letter that I received Aug. 26 from Cynthia Grubbs, director of the Division of Practitioner Data Banks, HHS, regarding the Star's possible use of National Practitioner Data Bank information. Your client, Dr. Robert Tenny, was co'd by Grubbs as a recipient of that letter.

I would welcome any comment or explanation from you or Dr. Tenny about why Dr. Tenny's name appears on this letter. Specifically, did you or Dr. Tenny bring my reporting to the attention of HHS?

Please feel free to call or email me this afternoon.

Yours,

Alan Bavley Kansas City Star 816-234-4858 abavley@kcstar.com

1

# **femple takes shape in Northland**

+

and it is to be finished in the spring. square-foot structure. eastern spire overlooking the 32,000-A gold-leaf angel Moroni sits atop the under construction in Kansas City, North The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day ints' Kansas City Missouri Temple is

MIKE RANSDELL | THE KANSAS CITY STAR



## MALPRACTICE RECORDS | Patient advocacy groups stunned by governments action

WORL

PESK

SH A

government learned The Shutdown comes after to use its reports. **Kansas City Star planned** 

The Kansas City Star By ALAN BAVLEY

actions involving thousands of docdata on malpractice and disciplinary shutdown of public access to protesting the government's atient advocacy groups are

E SCENE KO

tors nationwide.

Bank maintains confidential records censes or staff privileges to doctors. and insurance plans use in granting hthat state medical boards, hospitals The National Practitioner Data

cess to its reports with the names of cians aren't available to the public, the doctors and hospitals and other idendata bank for many years provided ac-Although records naming physi-

tifying information removed. That changed Sept. 1 when the data

> City Star planned to use its reports. The story about doctors with long histories of alleged malpractice but shortly after it learned The Kansas from its website. The action came bank removed these public-use files Kansas or Missouri medical boards who have not been disciplined by the

mation to the contents of court reneurosurgeon by matching its inforbank reports to a Johnson County was published on Sept. 4. The Star linked anonymous data

SEE DATA BANK | A7

and others that show your ability to triangulate on data bank data. man for the Health and Human Ser dential," said Martin Kramer, spokeshave a responsibility to make sure under federal law that it remains confi-"We've seen (The Star's) reporting ₹

often use this technique to glean addicords of malpractice cases. Journalists honal information about doctors irom

the data.

Westpo opens 

st target of choice?

-fashioned grease

someone sto

cle the parts for plati-

рашасичти 🖓

verters off cars, so they

r crooks ripping cata-

or the copper wiring es raiding air condi-

the public about cop

v weeks, it seems, po-

big believers in

DATA BANK: Newspaper used only publicly available information must investigate any potential to make sure that it rei

LOCAL | THE KANSAS CITY STAR

WEDNESDAY/SEPTEMBER 14:2011

ources and Services Adminisversees the data bank. ices Department's Health Rethe public-use files availramer said his agency may gain after a "thorough b of the data field." But the agency that Sly will take FROM A4

removal of the files.

Care Journalists also opposes

The Association of Health

porting by Robert Tenny

was alerted to The Star's re-

Kramer said the data bank

reporting upon. In order to provide Tenny with an opporphysician the newspaper was

publicly available information

The Star, however, used only

from the Data Bank.

DONATE CARS

**RUCKS, BOATS & RVS** 

Blue Book Value on Most (

Running or Not - NO Restrictions

CHILDREN'S CANC

All Receipts & IRS Forms ON THE SPO

SAME DAY-FREE PICK UP

monetary penalties.

tunity to respond, The Star no-

ified Tenny's lawyer on Aug.

ply is no substitute for the NPDB Public Use Data File if medical licensing. There sim-

> open government," she said."I see this action as totally coun-

In a letter Aug. 26, the bank's director Cynthia Grubbs, ad-

of data bank confidentiality

vised The Star that violations

"Once we became aware that To reach Alan Bavley, call this information may be made 816-234-4858 or send ema

breaches of confidentiality.

confidential," he said.

public, we had a responsibility

abavley@kcstar.com.

provisions are subject to a civil

ter to that."

this vital research is to be con-

tinued," the letter said.

viously, the files could be loaded from the data they had been. eturn in the same formonths and the files

> group, "We've seen our mempresident of the medical writer

this," said Charles Ornstein

We'te really disturbed by

pers do terrific work (with the

files) that protects the public."

several matters contained

stein said.

But Kramer said his agency

on their own website," Ornusing information that they put be intimidating reporters for "A federal agency should not

the data bank.

tended to publish, including 16 of specific information it in-

igned practitioner numheets. Names of docwebsite as massive e replaced by arbitra-

> Carolina citing the data bank's News & Observer in

public use files as a source on

doctors whom they named

"If it were not for this infor-

by the Hartford Courant in

Ornstein pointed to stories

Connecticut and the Raleigh

North

is of malpractice payments as well as the dollar ages of doctors and paoctor age 40 to 49, rather presented as ranges, such

naké public files immediately The bank is not mandated to as specific numbers.

"Why are they picking on this (Star) article?" asked Lisa

ers Union's Safe Patient Pro-McGiffert, director of Consum-

ect. Consumers Union, which

strong," he said

stories would not have been as mation used by reporters, theu

ELIDINE OB MULTE

EXP 9/30/11

Together, Dental

Open 24/7 Phones

800-710-666

www.donatecarsinkc.com

Kansas City, MO

American Children's Society, Inc.

Sau TAX DEDUCTIBL

Health for Life

required to respond to inforiccessible on its website, but is ution requests.

use the files in meaningfu ably make it more difficult to "Whatever they do will prob-

> the agency to put its files back wants greater public disclosure

er Protectio

Hot Summer S

by the data bank, will be asking

online, she said.

"This

administration (of

been touting their position for President Barack Obama) has

ways," said Alan Levine, a health care researcher with hublic Citizen's Health Re-

of this data is crucial to patien

"The continued availability

afety

and research aimed at

al of the public-use files.

sources and Services Adminis-

The Kanese City Star is published daily. Subscriptions to The Kanese City Star are available either by home delivery or by mail. By home delivery, 7: Issues per week or 6 issues per week (Mon:-Stal). \$4.89 per week week or 6 issues per week (Mon:-Stal). \$4.90 per week pus applicable sales tax- and delivery. whith the Five County Metropolitan Area; and \$5.20 per week plus county Metropolitan Area; and \$5.20 per week plus

applicable sales tax and delivery outside the Five C Metropolitan Area; Thursday-Sunday, & Holidays

per week plus applica

September 14, 2011. Vol. 131 No. THE KANSAS CITY STAR 290-240 (ISSN 0745-1

MDERS INEWEDN

FURNACE &

INSTALLED

S100 GAS GA

SURVERVICEN 

PUBLISHER'S NOTICE

ation objecting to the remov-

sent a letter to the Health Re-

On Tuesday, Public Citizen

or patient safety

arch Group, which advocates



Robert T. Tenny, M.D. Neurological Surgery

10550 Quivira -- Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988

September 15, 2011

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Bank Department of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

Dear Ms Grubbs,

In the bottom right-hand corner of the Shawnee Mission Medical Center advertisement that appeared in the Kansas City Star on 9/11/11 and forwarded to you on that day, there are three logo, Shawnee Mission Medical Center, The Kansas City Star and KMBZ (local radio/television station).

Wednesday, 9/14/11, for 6-7:30 PM, on a call-in talk show on KMBZ, the host, Darla Jay, main topic was the recent closure of the public portion of the National Practitioner Data Bank on September 1, 2011 and she "blamed" it on Dr. Tenny for reporting a Kansas City Star reporter, Alan Bavley. She, subsequently, began a negative portrayal of Dr. Tenny, while encouraging caller participation.

One could speculate that this is a coordinated attack.

I received, but did not return, a phone call from Kevin O'Reilly, a Chicago based reporter for the American Medical News, 312-64-4489.

I do not intend to be a gadfly in your investigation, but rather, I want you to have the "local" information that might not be available to you for your project.

Sincerely,

Rober & Tenny, mg

Robert T. Tenny, M.D.



Director Division of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

h.h.M.d.d.d.h.h.a.M.h.d.d.d.



Robert T. Tenny, M.D. Neurological Surgery

10550 Quivira – Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988

September 20, 2011

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Bank Department of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

Dear Ms Grubbs,

Enclosed is a copy of an additional Editorial that appeared in the Sunday, September 19, 2011 edition of the Kansas City Star.

Sincerely,

Robert & tenny, mo

Robert T. Tenny, M.D.

Climate change deniers have to be struggling to cling to their beliefs like polar bears on shrinking blocks of

ice in the Arctic. The evidence keeps mounting. Scientists with the National Snow and Ice Data Center in now report that the Arctic sea ice this summer has melted to its second-lowest level since recordkeeping began n 50 years ago. Like an ice cube in a drink, the sea ice is getting smaller. Lewis Diuguid, Kansas City Star editorial page columnist, on the Midwest Voices blog at voices.kansascity.com

## THE STAR'S EDITORIALS

THE KANSAS CITY STAR.

le Care Act is showing positive results

## 1th care reform



THOMPSON I THE ASSOCIATED PRESS 5 are a goal of the new law.

e new law allowing to remain on parents' is up to age 26. in Medicare spending ; as hospitals move ncy and quality meaed in the law. ging trends are lost on detractors. se out in Jefferson City n a group of GOP ding a hearing to pron of a state insurance he mistaken idea that bureaucrats were authorizing the exchange at that very moment at the order of Gov Jay Nixon.

The senators charged across town to where the board of the Missouri Health Insurance Pool was discussing a \$21 million federal grant to help build the technological infrastructure for an exchange. After consulting with the senators, the board postponed action on a resolution to accept the grant.

Similar nonsense has prevailed in Kansas, where Gov.

Sam Brownback foolishly returned a \$31.5 million federal grant to design an exchange.

These politicians hope that by being obstinate, they can derail the health care reform law they so despise. But they are denying their states the opportunity to design affordable, consumer-friendly insurance marketplaces.

Opponents of reform need to tell the public what they intend to do about the problem of uninsured Americans. "Let them die" isn't an acceptable fallback position.

## Stop trying to protect dangerous doctors

Attack on the public's right to know

President Barack Obama's administration has gone overboard in trying to protect physicians from the public's right to glean essential information about their doctors. A move by the Department of

Health and Human Services to shut down an online database betrays promises by Obama and Secretary Kathleen Sebelius to promote transparency in health care. Public access must be restored immediately.

Removal of the National Practitioner Data Bank followed The Kansas City Star's story about a Kansas neurosurgeon with a trail of malpractice lawsuits. Despite being sanctioned by a hospital and having to pay almost \$4 million in response to the lawsuits, Robert Tenny was in good 'standing with the Kansas State Board of Healing Arts.

The U.S. Health Resources and Services Administration held out the possibility of financial penalties if The Star published a story using informa-

tion from the database. The Star printed the story, and the government shut down the public portion of the data bank, which journalists have used for over a decade to inform the public about doctors whom they entrust with their care.

SUNDAY, SEPTEMBER 18, 2011

The public data bank files list disciplinary and malpractice actions against doctors, who are identified by a number rather than a name. Reporters mine the bank for generic stories about problematic doctors and have used other information to learn some physicians' identifies.

Reporting assisted by the data bank has led to reforms in state laws and a greater emphasis on transparency and patient care by state medical boards.

Groups that advocate on behalf of journalists and consumers are protesting the government's move. The Department of Health and Human Services, should listen, Its job is to protect, the public, not physicians with records they would like to hide.



ISTAR/ judge@testar.com

CHAT WITH THE EDITORIAL STAFF The Star's editorial page staff likes hearing and sharing opinions

which would be taxable income.

This allows him to avoid income and Social Security taxes. Rather than complain about others, I would like to





#### Robert T. Tenny, M.D. Neurological Surgery

10550 Quivira – Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215 PHONE (913) 831-0000 FAX (913) 831-9988

September 22, 2011

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Bank Department of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

Dear Ms. Grubbs,

Enclosed is a copy of another article that was published in the Kansas City Star on Thursday, September 22, 2011. Stay strong and keep up the good work!

Sincerely,

Rochel & tering , mo

Robert T. Tenny, M.D.

Reopen National Practitioner Data Bank files, groups urge Con... Page 1 of 3



#### Reopen National Practitioner Data Bank files, groups urge Con... Page 2 of 3

In a story published Sept. 4, The Star reported finding 21 doctors in the two states who had 10 or more payouts, but had not been disciplined.

The Star story also detailed the history of one of the 21 doctors, neurosurgeon Robert Tenny. The newspaper was able to identify Tenny in the data bank by comparing the information to court records.

After being contacted by The Star for comment about lawsuits and information in the data bank, Tenny's attorney complained to the data bank.

The data bank then sent a letter to The Star notifying it of civil fines that can be imposed for improper use of its confidential information.

The Star, which had used only the data bank's public use file, did not remove from its story the material about Tenny that it discovered there.

The data bank may make the public use file available again, a spokesman has said. But that process probably will take at least six months and the files may not return in the same format.

The groups calling for restoration of the public use file include the Association of Health Care Journalists, Investigative Reporters & Editors, the National Association of Science Writers, the National Freedom of Information Coalition, the Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press and the Society of Professional Journalists.

Consumers Union and Public Citizen's Health Research Group, which advocate for patient safety, also have asked that the data bank file be made public again.

To read more, visit www.kansascity.com.

Posted on Thu, Sep. 22, 2011 06:17 AM

Share 📴 Email 📴 Print 🏨

DAILY DEALS (UP TO 99% OFF) IN YOUR INBOX	Get The Star \$1.25/week
dealsaver	now for only
dealsaver o findosave O Your Savings Source	Click here for this special offer 😕 🖈

Like

Add New Comment

Type your comment here.

Real-time updating is enabled. (Pause)

Showing 0 comments

Sort by newest first

Login

Subscribe by email S RSS



Executive Secr	•
Computer Tech Leavenworth Cour	
Budget Renl-A-Ca	ice Representatives ar
	intenance Tech
DRIVERS Kelly Services for	FeuEx Ground
ا المالة بالمحي الوالد	View More
тне моят	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Read	Commented
	e working on agreement

Dan Beebe working on agreement to exit Big 12 Anxiety, frustration bedevil Big 12 fans Dan Beebe working on agreement to depart as Big 12 chief Black Cherokees regain tribal citizenship Star power forward Perry Ellis of Wichita commits to Kansas Mizzou's Jerrell Jackson fills up

## Reopen National Practitioner Data Bank files, groups urge Con...

I ugo 5 or 5	Page	3	of	3
--------------	------	---	----	---

GO	<u>\$79/HR Job - 288 Openings</u> Make \$79/hr Working From Home. Regulrements: Computer. As Seen On MSN. www.governmentjobs.com/jobs -			
	2.5% Refinance Rates No Hidden Fees. No Obligation. Get Free Quotes Nowi 2.9%apr Refinance.QuotesHound.com			
	Man "Cheats" Credit Score News: He Added 127 Points to HIs Credit Score Using This 1 Easy Tip www.TheCreditSolutionProgram.com			
Ads by Yahoo!				
	Terms of Service   Privacy Policy   About our ads   Copyright			

					the second s	the second s	
HOME	NEWS	SPORTS	BUSINESS	LIFESTYLE	ENTERTAINMENT	OPINION	PROMO
		Columnists	Columnists	Columnists	Columnists	Columnists	Place an Ad
Columnists	Columnists Breaking News	Chiefs	Announcements	Food	ink	Editorials	Jobs
Blogs	Nation & World	Royals	Consumer News	House & Home	Horoscopes	Letters to the Editor	Cars
Obituaries	Politics	Sporting KC	Technology	Faith	Comics		Real Estate
Veather Traffic	Lotteries	KU	Workplace	Star Magazine	Games		Rentals
C Pets	Neighborhoods	K-State	Star 50	Travel	Movies		Classifieds
Community Faces	JoCo	MU	Stocks	Health	Music		Shopping
Forums	Info Central	High Schools		Celebrations	Performing Arts		
bout The Star	News Projects	Stats		Dear Abby	Calendar		
Video	•	Outdoors			Star TV		

http://www.kansascity.com/2011/09/22/3159442/reopen-national... 9/22/2011



;





1. S. C. N.

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Health & Human Services Mail Stop 8-103 Rockville, MD 20857

hdululululululululul

Health Resources and Services Administratio

**Bureau of Health Professions** 

Rockville, MD 2085

#### SEP 26 2011

Robert T. Tenny, M.D. 10550 Quivira - Suite 230 Overland Park, Kansas 66215

Dear Dr. Tenny:

This letter is in response to your six letters dated September 4, 5, 7, 11, 14 and 15, 2011, regarding the publication by the Kansas City Star of an article concerning yourself. The public use file has been removed from our website while we review the integrity and confidentiality of the data. The public use file is intended for statistical research purposes only and data contained in these files is de-identified. We contacted the hospitals and health centers (this included the statistical research purposes).

requirements and the sanctions for violations of confidentiality. We instructed the hospitals to examine their records and report back to us with any potential confidentiality breaches. We will act swiftly to investigate any potential violations of confidentiality.

As for your complaints regarding the questionable medical record keeping and possible Medicare fraud by Shawnee Mission Medical Center, this falls outside our authority to maintain the National Practitioner Data Bank. The U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Office of the Inspector General maintains a hotline, which offers a confidential means for reporting Medicare fraud and abuse. The hotline can be contacted by the following means:

By Phone:	1-800-HHS-TIPS (1-800-447-8477)
By Fax:	1-800-223-2164 (no more than 10 pages)
By E-Mail:	HHSTips@oig.hhs.gov
By Mail:	Office of the Inspector General HHS TIPS Hotline P.O. Box 23489 Washington, DC 20026

1

Thank you for sharing your concerns with us. We are working to ensure that the National Practitioner Data Bank has policies and procedures in place to ensure the confidentiality and integrity of the information we maintain.

Sincerely,

(°, ex Arubbo

Cynthia Grubbs, R.N., J.D. Director Division of Practitioner Data Banks